

What is the evidence?

Brief Summary:

Someone with keys removed hand records three weeks running.

All keyholders except Steve Male were eliminated as suspects.

We don't know when it happened the first week. Steve Male was in on his own during the day the second time it happened. Steve Male was in on his own both days when hand records were removed from two boxes over a weekend.

His scores were elevated in particular over the previous 9 weeks prior to this being uncovered. Of the other keyholders only Alan showed a much more modest improvement.

Other possibilities about people gaining access to keys were shown to be hardly feasible.

In detail:

Why was it a keyholder?

It was very highly likely after week 1, almost completely certain after week 2, 100% certain after week 3. So this is indisputable, details are in Appendix A.

Could someone else have got hold of keys?

This is highly improbable. Only some people in the club can use the keys. Give most members a set of keys and ask them to open the club, they would manage to get in.

Unfortunately they would probably severely injure themselves as the club would be in darkness and / or they would set off the alarm.

More details in Appendix B

Which keyholder?

An assumption is made that no other keyholder has any personal animosity towards Steve Male. Also they are all unknown to have any malicious streak. All evidence is clear that the other keyholders were perfectly friendly and had never had any issues with him. It is therefore taken that nobody has made anything up or tried to frame Mr Male in any way.

The first week Alan, Katie and Angus were all away, Angus being the only one who came back that Monday. He discovered the missing hand record.

Bob and Cathy have nothing to do with Mondays and are away in Fife from Thursday to Tuesday every week. They also knew the subsequent weeks what was going on, removing hand records would have been framing Steve.

This only left Steve and Victor.

Victor was away the next week. He didn't leave until the Thursday but wasn't playing the following Monday. Also by the third week Victor knew what was going on and taking a hand record would have been putting the blame on Steve.

Steve was the only possible suspect.

Keyholder	7 th Aug	14 th Aug	21 st Aug
Steve	Played	Played	Played
Katie	Away	Played	Played
Alan	Away	Played	Played
Victor	Played	Away	Played
Bob	Never played	-----	-----
Cathy	Never played	-----	-----
Angus	Uncoverer of	wrong doing.	

In addition Steve Male was in the club on his own on Thursday 10th August and we know for certain that the hand record went missing that day. Also Steve was in the club on his own on Saturday 19th and Sunday 20th August when we know that two hand records disappeared, one from each box *, over that weekend.

In a situation like this everyone wants to know about his results, the problem is nobody knows when it started. Steve Male has had keys since April, however for the early part of the year he was usually left alone in the club each Thursday. It couldn't have been in January as we didn't play any Gemini hands then, so the Investigatory Panel was given the average score achieved by himself with his regular partner over February until July. This gave an even 6 months and showed a very elevated average score with his regular partner compared to the previous two years. Their match points scores on Wednesdays and Thursdays had remained much the same as previous years. The importance of this of course is that their scores had neither gone down or remained the same which would have cast a huge question mark over the whole affair.

As nobody knows when it started perhaps a better way of looking at it would be to go backwards over two months from when it was last possible to have accessed the hand records in advance. Playing with his regular partner and using the Gemini set their positions in a tournament of 15-18 tables were:

	7/8	31/7	24/7	17/7	10/7	3/7	26/6	19/6	12/6
With regular partner	1st	2nd	1st	no	2nd		2nd		4th
With Mike				play		4th		2nd	

On the 14th and 21st August when the real hand records were not available he was 16th with Steve Bailey and 9th = with regular partner.

Possibly this period is significant as we draw a card on a Monday night to determine which way we sit. Usually it was Katie or Edna and sometimes Steve who would do this. Around the middle of June Steve came in very early each week and took over handing out the cards.

If you try to study a hand record you will soon realise it is a big advantage to know which way you are sitting.

So, on the evidence the Investigatory Panel decided that it was much more likely than not that Steve Male had removed the hand records. Whether this is enough to make an Investigatory Panel 'comfortably satisfied' has not been tested.

* Why two? The perpetrator had removed a redealt set of hand records the week before . They remove a hand record from the right hand box, get it home and find it is the same discarded set as last week. Therefore they go back and remove one from the left hand box assuming the correct ones are in there.

APPENDIX A

Keyholder responsible

A hand record for Monday 7th August was found to be missing on that Monday. It could have been taken anytime since the previous Wednesday. There was nothing on in the club (over this entire period) and the back room would be shut off. It was highly likely that it could only have been taken by someone on their own in the club (someone with keys).

The Gemini boards were redealt on Tuesday 8th August, the hand records printed, 20 were carefully counted into the folders in each box and the outer copies were marked. The boxes were put in place at the end of Tuesday's tournament. At the end of Wednesday's tournament I checked the marked copy at the top of the right hand box* and it was still there. On coming in on Thursday at 6:30 it had been removed. I redealt those boards. It could only have been taken by someone in on their own on Thursday.

The Gemini hands were redealt the following Tuesday and the boxes put back at the end of the tournament. I did not print the hand records, I placed 19 in the left hand box and 20 on the right, again with the outer copies marked. All hand records were in situ on Thursday evening when I locked up. Nothing was on in the club over that weekend. On Monday I came in and found the top marked copies had been removed from both boxes. Only a keyholder could possibly have done this.

APPENDIX B

Someone else have access to keys?

As stated most people couldn't use them. A list of all people who played the three Mondays in question has been drawn up and there are certainly two people who could have used them. Their scores were certainly **not** notable over the summer and followed the usual ups down.

If we are to believe that someone had access to another set of keys you would also have to believe in the coincidence that they took a hand record on the Thursday of the second week the day Steve was in the club on his own and a further coincidence that they took a hand record on the weekend when Steve was in the club on his own and took a second hand record when Steve was in alone a second time. Coincidentally they did not take one the next week when Mr Male had handed in his keys (though some people knew by then what was happening).

Also over the recent period before this was discovered no pair had shown any particular improvement in scores or had a good run except S Male.

* The way the boxes are placed you can only access the left hand one by removing the right hand one. Also when you open the folder of hand records the top one presents itself. If someone takes a hand record it will always be from the right hand box and the top copy.